

Updated Options Appraisal: Alternative Library Service Provision

This updated options appraisal summarises work originally considered in 2014 prior to the consultation on the future library strategy.

Its conclusions should be considered in parallel with the appraisal of options in relation to the identified needs of Protected Groups, and the EHRIA's for each library affected.

Sponsor: Nigel Thomas Head of Service

Author: Tracey Beighton Locality Manager/Lorraine Selby Locality Manager

Date: September 2015

Required Performance Outcome			<p>To identify the most cost effective and efficient way of delivering a library service to communities where the community library may close and to meet MTFS targets for savings.</p> <p>Summary of options to be considered</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Community library book collection 2. Trust lending model 3. LendIT vending machine 4. Mobile Library service
Options available to change performance	Option 1		<p>1. <u>Community Library Book Collection</u></p> <p>The model:</p> <p>This would consist of a collection of books to be taken to an existing community building i.e. Community Centres, schools or local shops.</p> <p>This would be a weekly service delivered on a specific day with stock and mobile shelving delivered to the location prior to the service being open to the public. A paid Library Service Assistant would set up and deliver the service on site.</p> <p>Assumptions:</p> <p>The mobile Library Management System will be used to record loans.</p> <p>A free request service would be available for customers to support the service and complement the level/quantity of stock available.</p> <p>Laptops will be used to offer IT if not otherwise available within the community. 3G technology would need to be used to provide internet access if internet access is not available within the community venue.</p> <p>Health and safety audit would need to be carried out prior to hiring the venue to ensure it meets standards expected and a risk assessment will be required for potential lone working.</p> <p>Transportable shelving units would be available to display items within the community venue.</p> <p>New and exchanged stock would form part of the stock offer</p>

	Option 2		<p><u>2. Trust Lending System</u></p> <p>A vehicle would drop off a collection of books to a suitable community venue and users would borrow items on trust with no record being kept of what stock was being loaned/returned.</p> <p>This option could additionally be developed as a swap box system where customers could bring their own books and exchange them for another book within the collection.</p> <p>Book collections would be changed and replenished quarterly.</p>
	Option 3		<p><u>3. Self Service vending machine.</u></p> <p>This option is based upon a vending machine self- service approach where the vending machine holds a selection of books and audio materials and can be accessed by a library user using their library membership card.</p> <p>The vending machine can be located in any suitable location within a community such as community building, local shop or doctors etc. They can also be located outside but do require some shelter – a canopy of some kind would need to be constructed if not already present, this may require planning permission.</p> <p>For the purposes of the appraisal one typical supplier has been selected and its LendITS model range selected.</p> <p>The specification included:</p> <p>The availability of modules ranging from 200 – 1000 items.</p> <p>The availability of add on options such as payments for usage and/or charges or fees with the option for card and/or cash payments</p> <p>The potential to set limits on a user's account, meaning that once a user reaches their maximum lending limit, which is predetermined by LCC, then no further loans would be authorised.</p> <p>The ease which staff can load and retrieve items. The requirement for items returned to the unit to automatically go back into stock for loan.</p>
	Option 4		<p><u>4. Mobile Library Service</u></p> <p>A mobile library would visit a community on a weekly basis for a determined length of time.</p> <p>There would be options available to the Community to express their preference for where the vehicle stops which might include multiple stops within a community or one or two longer stops in a central and accessible location. There would also be an option to have 1 visit for one day a week or two visits for half a day per week.</p> <p>Users would have access to a range of stock which is changed on a rota basis.</p> <p>The mobile will also offer local information to customers, items for sale i.e. Postage stamps and could be provided with access to the internet through laptops or Ipads.</p> <p>3G Technology would need to be purchased to enable internet access.</p>

The following costings are based upon 1 closed library being replaced with 1 alternative solution, and all stock being provided from the closed library.

Multiple libraries being replaced will not necessarily increase capital 'one off' costs nor running costs

Capital costs of mobiles and driver and vehicle revenue costs are not included as spare capacity within the fleet would be utilised.

Costs, benefits and risks of each option	Costs	Per 48 Week delivery Annual running costs	One off payment	Benefits	Disadvantages/Risks
Option1. Community Library Book Collection – Based on 48 week delivery.	Venue Costs Laptops for public use. 3G dongle Staffing costs Stock Vehicle costs Maintenance fuel etc.	£5,712 £25 £4886 £0 £1500	 £1,695 £31,000	Utilisation of an existing building within each community. Stock could be specific to the community using stock from existing resources. WIFI/computers may already be available within the chosen location and therefore available for longer periods. Smaller stock being provided would allow for a reduction in book fund.	Cost of venue(s) and of staffing would not achieve savings targets within the MTFS. Limited stock can be provided. One off Capital costs for equipment e.g. Van, laptops Potential inconsistency of service depending upon venue. Heavy lifting, unpacking/packing of stock and equipment may have Health and Safety implications.
Total cost		£12,123	£32,695		
Option 2 Trust System	Staffing costs Vehicle for stock delivery Maintenance and insurance of vehicle Sack barrow to transport crates	£300 £1500	 £31,000 £50	Minimum staff input. Smaller stock being provided would allow for a reduction in book fund.	Loss of control over level of stock available and return for use within reasonable timescales for others to use Any donated stock may not meet library standards and there is no control over age inappropriate borrowing Stock may become depleted prior to quarterly exchange and either have to be supplemented with resulting increased revenue costs or there is an increased risk of user dissatisfaction. No additional service available i.e.

Costs, benefits and risks of each option	Costs	Per 48 Week delivery Annual running costs	One off payment	Benefits	Disadvantages/Risks
Option 2 Trust System Cont'd					access to IT, requests Stock would fall outside of LCC stock management processes and be difficult to ensure quality of service being delivered
Total cost		£1,800	£31,050		
Option 3 LendIT lending machine	Cost of machine (based on 400 items) Installation costs Annual licence support maintenance costs Staffing Siting costs and power costs unknown.	£3,100 £543	£35,500 £2,900	Possibility of improved access depending upon location of vending machine. Minimum staff input. Transport needed to deliver service is restricted to periodic replenishment. A mix of books and other media could be provided	Limited stock choice within the lending machine due to the small quantity of books/other media that can be held. Frequency of necessity to restock machine may vary depending upon locality and use. Cost of renting space/paying for electrical supplies May not be a suitable venue within every community. No IT facilities available. High capital and revenue costs
Total		£3,643	£38,400		
Option 4. Mobile Library Service	3G Dongle Laptops	£25	£1,695	Accessibility to over 2,000 items of stock. Potential for some IT access depending upon connectivity within the community and vehicle size. Wider LCC service available i.e. Requests. Cheap to provide as utilising underused capacity within the fleet.	Limited opening hours. Difficulty parking especially for long periods of time. Risk of vehicle breakdowns. A history of some difficulties in recruiting HGV drivers or drivers with CPC.
Total cost		£25	£1,695		
Timescale				There is an assumption that libraries without a feasible outline business plan may close at the end of May 2016.	

Costs, benefits and risks of each option	Costs	Per 48 Week delivery Annual running costs	One off payment	Benefits	Disadvantages/Risks
Supporting changes				Depending upon the option(s) chosen staff recruitment and training will need to be considered.	
Recommended solution and rationale				<p>It is recommended that the mobile library service be the preferred option as it provides a better stock offer and is more cost efficient than other options considered</p> <p>The rationale for this is that capacity has been made available within the existing library mobile service to make this change at no additional cost in revenue or capital.</p>	
Describe the change trajectory				Changes to create capacity in the existing fleet will take effect from 1 st January 2016. This will enable an implementation plan to be developed in detail following the decision to close being taken in March and delivered from 1 st June 2016.	

September 2015

This page is intentionally left blank